

# **Seattle Light Rail Review Panel**

Julie Bassuk

Design Commission, LRRP Co-Chair

**David Cutler** 

Planning Commission, LRRP Co-Chair

**Catherine Benotto** 

**Planning Commission** 

**Dan Corson** 

**Public Art Advisory Committee** 

**Mary Fialko** 

**Design Commission** 

**Shannon Loew** 

**Design Commission** 

**Kurt Kiefer** 

**Public Art Advisory Committee** 

**Laurel Kunkler** 

**Design Commission** 

**Kevin McDonald** 

**Planning Commission** 

**Tom Nelson** 

**Design Commission** 

Julie Parrett

Design Commission/

Public Art Advisory Committee

Osama Quotah

**Design Commission** 

**Norie Sato** 

Design Commission/

Public Art Advisory Committee

**Donald Vehige** 

**Design Commission** 

**Debbie Wick-Harris** 

**Design Commission** 

Valerie Kinast

Coordinator

**Tom Iurino** 

Senior staff

May 17, 2012

Convened 8:00 am

Adjourned 11:30 am

**Project Reviewed** 

Brooklyn Station Light Rail Review Panel – 60% Design

**Panel Members Present** 

Julie Bassuk, Chair

Mary Fialko

Julie Parrett

Shannon Loew

Tom Nelson

Catherine Benotto

Norie Sato

Laurel Kunkler

Debbie Wick-Harris (excused from 8:00am-8:45am)

Don Vehige

**Excused Panel Members** 

Osama Quotah

Kurt Kiefer

Dan Corson

David Cutler

Kevin McDonald

**Staff Present** 

Valerie Kinast

Tom Iurino

May 17, 2012 Project: Brooklyn Station Light Rail Review Panel

Phase: 60% Design Last Reviewed: May 19, 2011

**Presenters:** Ron Endlich, Sound Transit

Mark Reddington, LMN Barbara Swift, Swift Company Barbara Luecke, Sound Transit

**Attendees:** Debora Ashland, Sound Transit

Molly Chapman, Sound Transit Marcia Koengeter, City of Bellevue Mike Koski-Harja, Swift Company Patrick McDonnell, community member

John Petterson, LMN Tracy Reed, Sound Transit Tyler Schaeffer, LMN Architects Robert Nichols, Sound Transit

Time: 8:30am - 11:30am

### Recusal

Panel member Quotah recused himself because his firm is working with Sound Transit on the light rail station at Brooklyn.

### **Disclosures**

Panel member Parrett works for the University of Washington.

Panel member Sato completed artwork for Sound Transit's Central Link.

## **Summary of Presentation**

Sound Transit and its design team presented the 60% design for the Brooklyn Light Rail Station. It will be located in the University District along Brooklyn Avenue Northeast between University Manor Apartments on Northeast 43rd Street and the Neptune Theatre on Northeast 45th Street. Two-thirds of the 12,000 boardings per day will go to or come from the University of Washington. The station will can accommodate transit-oriented development above, to be built by a to-be-determined developer after the station opens. The station's entrances will be adjacent to the Neptune Theatre and NE 43rd Street; they will feature elevators, escalators, stairs, covered bicycle parking, and ticketing machines. The sidewalk in front of the station on Brooklyn will be 24' wide; it is part of a proposed green street that extends from Portage Bay to Ravenna Park, which the city is in the process of planning. The team expected a six-month delay in 90% design to evaluate construction logistics; the team estimated construction would begin at the end of 2017.

Since the panel's last review at 30% design, the design team has developed the design and added Lead Pencil Studio to develop a concept for the artwork. Specifically, the team presented its major changes and updates at 60% design: the station's ability to accommodate a 65 or 85 foot TOD development above; the compliance with Sound Transit's sustainability checklist which included native plants, recycled and salvaged materials, low impact drainage and consideration of total cost of ownership; the further development of Brooklyn Ave. and NE 43<sup>rd</sup> St

green street streetscapes which included layered bands of planting at an angle to the street, benches, street trees, small plazas with a sidewalk pattern that entered into the station at the entrances, and a bicycle jumble; the removal of parking and loading on the east side of Brooklyn Ave.; station entries framed by a dark stone gasket; a widened lobby at the north entrance due to the relocation of an electrical room; exhaust fans routed up through the TOD and no longer on the alley; a south entry waiting area pulled clear of the circulation area to improve operations; a colored armature at the entry that weaved its way through the station to the platform and became an armature that held the platform lighting; the development of the structural members of the station box to appear as bow-ties; and the development of artwork that mapped architectural spaces and consisted of elements of a fictional urban streetscape displayed on one wall of the station interior at the platform level.

# **ACTION (by Vehige)**

The Light Rail Review Panel thanked Sound Transit and its design team for its presentation of the 60% design of the Brooklyn Light Rail Station. The panel appreciated the clear presentation and the improvements since the last review; it is excited, in particular, about the design of the Brooklyn Ave streetscape, the blurring of the design inside and outside the station entrances, and the sense of scale of materials at entries and street edges. By a vote of 9-1, the panel approved the 60% design, with the following comments:

#### **Public realm**

- Ensure that the street improvements will be completed as a whole; include a provision in the development agreement for the TOD to make sure the streetscape is implemented as designed.
- Develop a plan, beyond the proposed chain link fence and gravel, for the interim condition when the station is built but the TOD is not yet constructed.
- Further study the bicycle jumble. Develop its design to ensure it adds interest to the streetscape and station design, is functional, and avoids seeming forced.
- Consider using color for the stainless steel benches; the benches could serve as accents and placemakers on the street.
- Further develop and resolve the design and materials used at the entrance locations in the ground plane. Use scoring as the most important strategy.

# **Building exterior**

- Design the gasket around the entrance so that it transitions well into TOD building; develop design guidelines and design standards for the TOD in the RFP.
- Develop the design and use appropriate materials and finishes for the perforated metal panel to maintain its see-through quality. Mock-up a sample to study.
- Develop a design and use materials that discourage graffiti and enable graffiti removal.

### **Building interior**

- Develop the design to provide spaces and opportunities for buskers and vendors. Provide utilities and power in these spaces.
- Provide more space at the south station entrance, as it is the primary entrance. Provide enough space for people to gather at ticketing. Resolve the design of the ramp to provide needed accessibility while still maintaining the best flow for those who use the ramp and those who do not
- Refine the design of the structural elements "bowties"; consider designing the structure so it appears that it is floating. Determine the appropriate level of finish for the exposed structural materials.

Refine the design of the color band that winds its way from the station entrances to the platforms; consider a design that offers more surprise and is less rigorous. Consider a volumetric rather than a linear treatment to terminate the gesture.

#### Artwork

- Think broadly about what place the art represents; it need not represent Seattle.
- Ensure the video elements are included as an integral part of the art; they should remain a dynamic piece over time.
- Study the first four feet of the art work from the ground plane. Consider how the art meets the
  platform level, relates to pedestrians, and addresses the potential accumulation of dirt.
- Consider the color of the wall and the relationship that the color creates with the art.
- Consider developing some art elements on the platform so that the concept "spills over" to areas beyond the wall.

#### Overall

- Provide samples of the proposed materials, including the color bands.
- Provide the feasibility reports and background of TOD planning that led to the station design decisions such as the placement back-of-house uses within the development parcel (vent fans specifically).
- Provide the sustainability information for this station.

Panel member Kunkler voted no because she did not believe that the presentation provided information related to sustainable strategies and she was unclear as to what sustainable strategies were being employed by the project designers.

# **Panel Members' Questions and Comments**

Describe the streetscape design on Brooklyn: the sections; and the height of the curbs and plant materials. What is the intent of the design? What will we get? What is the plant material? I hope you're not obscuring views. I like that the design forces people to the crossings, and creates a nice barrier.

The site lines, clearance and height will be relatively low. The design builds layers of plants in bands out to street. The design is intentionally not orthogonal to the street.

What is the width of the site?

It is 100 feet deep, 175 feet between entries.

Have you engaged with the TOD consultant? Has the TOD design considered the location of the exhaust fans? Yes. Our design team has prepared studies of probable development alternatives and those studies have been reviewed by the TOD consultant. The future TOD can accommodate the exhaust fans. We believe it is a marketable site that is attractive for development.

Have you done circulation studies for 12000 boardings a day? How confident are you in the design?

Yes. We studied the flow of people and the station and entry capacity. We designed to the worst case scenario, a 15 minute peak load in the PM, when 850 patrons are using the station and two-thirds of them are arriving. We studied this scenario at both entries.

Can you share the specifics of rainwater treatment and low impact drainage?

The drainage area is in the streetscape. The site is fully developed and we are capturing water that is coming off the sidewalk in the landscape area.

What planning has taken place in the station areas for performance or music?

We are developing policies and permitting for buskers. It will happen, and there are plenty of small spaces for example on the mezzanine. The south entry will most likely be used by buskers or concessionaires.

Can you integrate the artwork with an armature strategy? Have you considered the placement of lighting system, maybe superimpose it over the artwork?

We've thought a little but not a lot about that. The armature is providing functional lighting. The artwork wall is not getting a lot of accent lighting and we will need to figure it out.

*Is there a mid-block connection to The Ave?* 

No. We looked at it, however it would require us to acquire more property, plus get through the station's back-of-house spaces.

Is there a place for street food in the streetscape?

Yes, there is enough space for street food to develop. There are 4-6 feet where curbs walls create eddies. But street food is not a formal part of the program.

Is the artwork Seattle-specific?

That is to be determined. The artist is making a direct connection between Brooklyn in NY and Brooklyn Ave in Seattle, but it is not resolved yet. We want something that is unexpected and magical, and not necessarily Seattle.

For the south entry from Brooklyn Ave, could the ADA access ramp be oriented to the lobby rather than away from the lobby? That way, the flow for everybody is the same. Why not just one ramp?

We studied many options. We wanted the entry to be as small as possible. It is a tough problem. In addition, the south entry from NE 43<sup>rd</sup> St is accessible and wide.

Is there no distinctly showy piece of all the sustainability elements that are included?

There is no pervious pavement; the design moves the water across to the planting bed. We have a list of 40 items required by Sound Transit's policies. We can provide them. We do not see sustainability as a marketing piece. For us, it is about what is best value we can get.

Does the sidewalk treatment extend inside the station?

Yes

Will tile on big wall get dirty? Will the ledges of the artwork get dirty? Be mindful of that.

The tile is large in size, with small joints. The tile is envisioned as a luminous white surface to bounce light. We may adjust the color now that artwork idea is formed. The tile has a glossy finish.

Where does the art start? It should be at same level of pedestrians on platform.

It starts 4 feet above. We will work out its placement, as the art develops.

I'm worried that if the benches and the bicycle jumble are just cut-out metal, it's going to look dorky. It might be confused as art.

We think the jumble of elements is good strategy. But we agree. We have to really be exuberant and go for it.

Will the stainless benches have any holes for water to drain out?

Yes.

Regarding the armatures and lights getting to the middle of the platform, could you look at how the volume at street level reappears at the platform? Study how to stop the line. Perhaps by widening it could you solve the problem.

Maybe. We'll study it.

Can people see through the perforated metal at the entries?

Yes.

Is there bike infrastructure along Brooklyn? Could there be more?

The bike lane width and location were developed in consultation with SDOT and is coordinated with SDOT's plans to continue the lane north and south along Brooklyn beyond this block.

People may stop on bike lane.

What is your confidence on the numbers needed for bike parking?

The numbers are based on Sound Transit projections. We also looked at other agencies. There are 101 spaces right now. The jumbled racks are additional parking.

What is the concrete finish of the cross bracing and structural members?

The finish will be raw and will not be painted.

Did you develop images of the interim condition for the TOD? Did you study it?

We are in the same place as at 30% design. The site will be fenced. Our goal is to enter partnership with a developer soon. We have been talking with the neighborhood about the interim period. The community has not focused on it.

Will the streetscape be built with the station?

It will be built out as presented, except that the seating walls and plantings at the future TOD are anticipated to be provided by the TOD. The street trees will be planted with the station development.

At the 30% review, we had asked how flyers, posters etc would be incorporated. What's the plan?

We considered where we've located the perforated stainless steel, but that would be solid. We don't have it incorporated yet. We are still interested in the possibility. We may locate it in the streetscape as additional elements. Sound Transit has built community kiosks in other communities if they maintain them.

What studies did you use to locate and size the bike storage?

They came from Sound Transit. We wanted the storage to be open to the street and visible. They are spread wide and to the street.

How are you designing the structure to accommodate TOD?

The station can accommodate an 85 foot building over the entries, and 125 feet between the entries.

What's the thought on alley activation?

The corner of the station is visible across the alley from the east on 43<sup>rd</sup> Street. We wrapped the treatment around the corner but did not add any new elements. The Chamber of Commerce wants to activate the alley. But Sound Transit has been more focused on the alley as a working alley. Many businesses rely on it, as does Sound Transit. That's the direction.

Will you do work on the west side of street?

In general, we will be replacing the west side of Brooklyn to match existing. We are adding a curb bulb at 43<sup>rd</sup> and Brooklyn and replacing trees. Our proposal is in synch with the SDOT green street framework.

(public realm)

I like the Brooklyn Ave streetscape.

Get the design implemented from 43<sup>rd</sup> to 45<sup>th</sup>. Sound Transit should be building streetscape improvements unless there is a developer on board. You should recommend the vision of the entire streetscape, and create a provision for it in the development agreement. We want a drawing that shows what SDOT will actually permit on the streetscape if developer is not on board on day one. We need to know what the minimum conditions are.

The circulation has been improved.

I understand challenge of south entrance ramp. Look for ways to make it better.

I really like the entrances; they are a good scale and color for neighborhood. It will be great to see real samples, especially as the art moves forward.

I like the blurring between inside and outside of the station.

I like inviting buskers and food carts into the station area. Make sure utilities are provided.

I'm not a fan of the bicycle jumble. It feels forced to try to design that. Design it for function and simplicity.

The jumble might work better is it were functional art. Need to focus on that.

Think about a squid bike rack or something like that.

Standard bikes racks in a jumble won't look good.

The jumble is a distraction, and bothers me. Find a more orderly solution.

Need more information to decide re: jumble. Analyze the problem. Make it good.

I like the pedestrian curb bulbs at 43<sup>rd</sup> and Brooklyn.

The stainless steel benches makes sense, as they are durable. But they are harsh. Apply color to stainless steel.

Color could come out of the station and used on benches, if color is a unifying design principle. Think of benches as a marker.

The paving too strongly differentiated.

Prefer change in scoring not in color. More subtle.

Look forward to refinement and samples.

#### (building at grade)

I like the wrapping of stone element as a gasket. Hard to know what it's reacting to. Should inform what comes down the road for development. Need to collaborate with the TOD developer. And need to integrate the gasket into the TOD project.

The team should recommend design standards for the TOD.

Resolve the leftover space, and develop a better understanding of the flow of patrons. There is no room to queue in the south station. The trap space behind the ADA ramp feels not yet resolved. Going with this solution to 90% makes me nervous.

The TOD site is challenging for residential development. The units are 45 feet deep, and the ventilation is in the middle. Why not move the TOD to give more room for circulation? Move the back-of-house of the station to the center of block.

Need to share developer homework. We need confidence that this will work. And we need a vision of how the TOD building might interact with the street.

Don't push into the box at street level, as it will limit future development.

The circulation is tight but it's much improved. Patrons know where to go now.

Consider reflectivity for the stainless steel panels with graphics. Figure out whether you can actually see through it. Don't want it to be a wall.

Think about maintenance of the perforated metal surface.

### (building below grade)

Make sure it is easy to clean graffiti off structural elements.

I like the color and lighting scheme. Need to resolve remaining issues. Provide samples.

The expression of the structural design is going toward abstraction, a bow tie. Make it more floating and abstract, as that approach would tie better into art.

I like the color. But the linearity of it is relentless. Make it more of a surprise.

#### (art)

The elements seem too much in the past. Play with time. There is the danger of the piece looking like a theater set. It doesn't bother me if it is or is not Seattle.

It would be odd if the streetscape is elevated above the platform. Look at resolution of the bottom 4 feet. Consider whether or not the art might get dirty, especially if moved lower.

The light is threaded too much with art and structural elements. Simplify.

The art piece should not be just limited to the wall. Study bringing art up onto the platform.

The scale of art and inclusion of video is good.

The design needs the video and light; it will be critical if they don't happen. Otherwise the art will be something that is pulled away vs. a window into something else.

I found the art jarring initially. Not integrated. But then I got the connections to Brooklyn NY. I like the image with the black wall. With the white wall, not so much.

#### (big picture)

I want to see the interim phases of the TOD concepts.

I would like a list of sustainable elements, including information on life cycle, where is it coming from, etc. Need to research.

Thanks for clear graphics; however the text is small.

The pictures of the model were great.

I strongly advocate the built street. I encourage the city and Sound Transit work together to make sure it is built as designed.